ARCHAEOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE 
ON THE EGYPTIAN GIRL TABLEAU ATTRIBUTED 
TO KAMAL-AL-MOLK; THE IRANIAN ROYAL PAINTER 
IN THE QAJAR ERA (1794 -1925 AD)

Kouros Samanian¹, Zahra Abbasi¹, Maryam Dashtizadeh²

¹University of Arts, Sarhang Sakhaei St., Hafez St., Tehran, Iran
²Isfahan University of Arts, Hakim Nezami St., Isfahan, Iran

Received: 10/04/2013
Accepted: 10/05/2013

Corresponding author: samanian_k@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

The Qajar Period (1794 - 1925 AD) had special features in the history of art in Iran. Art and paintings are greatly influenced by the art and culture of Europe during this period. The influence of European art began from the Safavid dynasty (1501 - 1722 AD), and reached its peak during the Qajar Period.

This study investigates Kamal-al-Molk’s living conditions in order to evaluate the social, political and cultural life of Kamal-al-Molk regarding the context and environment in which a painting of an Egyptian girl is found. On the one hand, the history of the related painting will be discussed for further understanding of its art, and on the other, a comparative study performed to identify the relationship between the painting and other works attributed to Kamal-al-Molk paintings evaluated in the comparative study including the two works of "Egyptian woman" and "Egyptian man" by Kamal-al-Molk at the Malik Museum. This study investigates whether the "Egyptian girl", installed at the Islamic Museum of the Iranian Islamic Parliament is correctly attributed to Kamal-al-Molk. Archaeological and art research approaches are used for the purpose of this study.

Through an archeological approach to the “Egyptian Girl” considering the signature date, subject, colors and composition in the painting, in conjunction with instrumental analysis on used material and technique which has been reported in another paper by the authors, the attribution of this artwork to Kamal-al-Molk is called into doubt.

KEYWORDS: Easel Paintings, Egyptian Girl, Qajar Era, Kamal-al-Molk, Iran, Europe
**INTRODUCTION**

Qajar era is an important period in the history of Iranian art because in this period art, and particularly painting is strongly influenced by the art and culture of Europe, and this combination of European and Iranian traditions emerges as a hybrid art. According to Pakbaz, in this period the royal portrait paintings and the influence of European Art reached their peak and in Qajar school, the human body is of fundamental importance (Pakbaz, 2005). This shows European themes and compositions in Persian paintings of the 18th century (Canby, 1999).

With the establishment of Iran’s relations with Europe in the early years of the Safavid dynasty, European influence on Iranian art began as well (Zoka, 1976). Minas was one of the first artists to bring European painting styles and themes to Iran. Painting the walls of the churches and noble houses, Armenian painters opened a new visual perspective accompanied by perspective in drawing, which resulted in the growth of concrete and earthly aspects in Iranian painting which can be seen in the Safavid oil paintings in Sukias House in Isfahan (Samanian, 2010). As time passed from the early to the late Qajar period, Iranian features and characteristics decreased gradually and it became more common to copy the works of the European renaissance masters. The first Qajar royal painter was Mirza Baba Naghashbashy (being painter). According to Pakbaz, Mirza Baba was one of the first artists to make oil painting commonly in Iran (Pakbaz, 2010). For the first time in Iran, and in the court of Mohammad Shah, one of Mehr Ali’s students, called Abol-Hassan Ghaffari, was the first Iranian artist to be trained in European countries such as France and Italy (Soheili Khonsari, 1989). After Abol-Hassan Ghaffari, many young students went to Europe for art training, among whom are Ali Akbar Khan, Mozayen-al-Dole and Abd-al-Motaleb Mostashar. In the second half of the 19th century, Christian bodies of the British Victorian era and European urban landscapes were the most popular themes in lacquer paintings (Akbari, 2010).

Iranian painter Mohammad Ghaffari, known as Kamal-al-Molk (1848-1940 AD), is considered as one of the best known and most influential figures in contemporary Iranian history. When Nasser al-Din Shah saw his artwork he became captivated by his art and called him to the court (Karimzade Tabrizi, 1991). On his arrival to the court, he was given the title of “Khan”, afterwards he was called “Pishkhedmat-e-Makhsus” (special attendant), he then became Naghashbashy (royal painter) and was finally given the title of "Kamal-al-Molk" (Soheili Khonsari, 1989). Thanks to him, the two hundred-year-old movement of integration of Iranian and European traditions came to its end and the tradition of European naturalism was promoted in academic art. "The paintings that belong to the period he was entitled as Naghashbashy numbered more than 170 paintings" (Ashtiani, 1963).

In this period, the artists were still under the influence of Europe and had grown apart from Persian art, sometimes in their themes and sometimes in their applied techniques. Kamal-al-Molk had great passion for oil painting, before traveling to Europe, and he had such an improvement that he had learned the rules of mathematics and geometric perspective and applied them carefully and consciously. After the death of Nasser al-Din Shah, Kamal-al-Molk went to Europe.

This journey, which took three years, was of great significance to Kamal-al-Molk, as it enabled him to discover the technical points and methods of the great masters such as Rembrandt, Harmenszoon van Rijn and Tiziano Vecelli, and several of his imitative artworks belong to this time clearly reflect his great interest, acceptance and faithfulness to the great European artists. On this journey he also, for a short time, companioned Ignace Henri Jean Théodore Fantin-Latour, a French painter of a relative in this time. He improved his art in Paris, Rome, Vienna and some other cities under supervision of the masters of European painting practically. In Europe he painted precious artworks and paintings from nature, and imitating the masters of the great European painters and he completed his experiences in oil painting and applying perspective. Mozafar-al-Din Shah in his travel report to Europe has pointed out a canvas that Kamal-al-Molk in a visit to the Louvre in Paris copied from the canvases of Louvre who has referred to

In most resources Paris and the Louvre are mentioned as places that Kamal-al-Molk has benefited for the study of the great European painters’ paintings but the details of his trip to Europe is not clear. From the beginning of his artistic career, Kamal-al-Molk showed a clear and great interest in European naturalism method. His travels to Europe began in the time of Classical art’s downfall. Impressionism was growing outrageously among the artistic circles and artists and gradually became known as a new style of painting. But the school never attracted Kamal-al-Molk (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 1987). The school of Kamal-al-Molk and his students, from its technical, formal and practical aspects, was a definitely European art. Thanks to him the influence of European painting in Iranian art became well established, and today’s generation of Iranian painters is a logical continuation of Kamal-al-Molk’s generation (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 1987).

"Egyptian Girl", one of the paintings attributed to Kamal-al-Molk, is kept in the Iranian Islamic Parliament Museum. Its size is 98/5cm x 68/5cm, and considering the surrounding frame it is calculated to be 119cm x 88/5cm, and the technique is oil painting. There are no traces and signs of a narrative or story in this painting. Further, it was not created for any specific goal to convey or communicate any idea or belief and, finally, this painting does not present any new definition of reality (Jansen, 1986:15).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

A combination of study on signature date, subject, colors and composition of the painting is used in this paper. For carrying out the various steps of this research, the documenting process was done with a single lens reflexive camera (Power Shot A490) manufactured by Canon Company, and Adobe Photoshop CS4 was used for documenting and editing digital images, as well as for investigating the effect of aesthetic proportions. Further, results in conjunction with instrumental analysis on used material and technique which have been reported in another paper (Samanian et al. 2013) were used for the conclusion of this study.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

According to the subscribed date on the canvas (Fig. 1), the date of the Egyptian Girl painting is 1874 AD. Considering the division of Pakbaz into the career of Kamal-al-Molk, three distinct periods are represented based on different stages of his life, i.e. the works created before his travels to Europe, works being created while he was on his way to Europe, and those created after his travels to Europe, being strongly influenced by this journey (Foroughi et al., 1997).

According to Khansari, Kamal-al-Molk began his journey to Europe in 1895 AD (Soheili Khansari, 1989). Hence, the Egyptian Girl painting on the canvas created in 1874 AD is among his works before his travels to Europe and Golbon noted in the Timeline of Kamal-al-Molk that, between 1884 and 1885 AD, Nasser al-Din Shah endowed the title of "Pishkhedmat-e-Makhsus" (special-attendant) on him and after that called him "Naghashbashy" (the painter) (Foroughi et al, 1997). Although there is some controversy about the exact date of Kamal-al-Molk’s being entitled "Naghashbashy and Pishkhedmat-e-Makhsus” in the sources of this paper, Khansari
declares that Kamal-al-Molk was granted the title of "the painter of his majesty" (Naghashbashy-e-hozur-e-Homayouni) in 1879 AD by Nasser al-Din Shah (Soheili Khansari, 1989).

Therefore, considering the possible validity of each of these dates regarding the registered/signing date of the "Egyptian Girl", this work must have been created sometime before his being entitled by this name. However, in the subscribed area at the bottom of the painting there is a signature, "Khanzad Mohammad-e-Ghaffari Naghashbashy-e-hozur-e-Homayouni".

There are three possibilities. Firstly, before being granted the title "Naghashbashy", Kamal-al-Molk may have signed his works with the same title. Evidence for this claim is the painting of "Government Camp", created in 1878 AD which, according to Golbon and Pakbaz, is known to be the oldest painting signed by the name "Naghashbashy". By taking into account what has been previously mentioned, creation of this painting goes back to sometime before he was granted the title "Naghashbashy-e-hozur-e-Homayouni".

Golbon noted that: "The oldest work attributed to Kamal-al-Molk is known to be a landscape painting named "Government Camp", and is dated back to 1878 AD" (Foroughi et al., 1997). According to Pakbaz before the time he was entitled as "Naghashbashy", Kamal-al-Molk had been working in the court for four years. The second possibility is that the exact date of him being granted the title "Naghashbashy" is not valid. The third is the case that this painting may not be among the paintings studied over and identified by researchers as the works of Kamal-al-Molk.

According to Karimzade Tabrizi, the works of Kamal-al-Molk are about one hundred fifty or more paintings, nearly all of which have been known and examined, and are now kept in museums and private collections (Karimzade Tabrizi, 1991).

Considering Kamal-al-Molk's memories and biographies, narrated by his friends and historians, and also his autobiography, there is no mention of a painting named "Egyptian Girl" regarding the subscribed time. This includes Karimzade Tabrizi's book concerning the lives and works of Iranian painters of the past time (Karimzade Tabrizi, 1991), Khansari in his book entitled 'Art Perfection' (Soheili Khansari, 1989), and also in a book named 'Kamal-al-Molk' which is a collection of some reviews and commentaries of some well-known authors (Foroughi et al., 1997), and the Memorial Book of Kamal-al-Molk compiled by Behnam Shabahang and Dehbashi (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 1987) can also be mentioned.

It is important to note here that, with respect to present thinking, "Egyptian Girl" can be considered as attributed to Kamal-al-Molk, then this work would be the oldest of his works, signed with the title "Naghashbashy", contrary to the declarations of many experts such as Pakbaz and Golbon, who have introduced the "Government Camp" painting, created in 1878 AD as the oldest work of Kamal-al-Molk signed with the title "Naghashbashy" (Foroughi, 1997).

The majority of Kamal-al-Molk works (more landscape painting and less portraits) during the period in which he is called "Naghashbashy" are considered as the main subject matter of the paintings. According to Pakbaz, "between the historical periods of Mohammad Ghaffari entitled Naghashbashy and the period in which he was entitled Kamal-al-Molk, there were many painting works with the main themes of the Qajar court and the total living conditions in the court. Generally, more landscapes and less active personages could be observed in the painting works and there were not any human features in the painting, they were..."
archaeological perspective on the egyptian girl tableau

Actually painted in a very small scale in the context of natural landscapes. Painting techniques in these works are somewhat hasty and weak" (ibid., 33). Kamal-al-Molk paintings' investigation in the period before being given the title Naghashbashy, including "Egyptian girl" painting, indicates that most paintings are similar in terms of technique and of course the works of this period by Kamal-al-Molk are weaker than the period after being entitled Naghashbashy. As mentioned before, according to Pakbaz, it is natural to observe better works of an artist and painter with painting ability and taste like Kamal-al-Molk after gaining experience and knowledge in the technical and visual artworks compared with his previous artworks. As shown in Fig. 3, the painting work of "Mohammed Ibrahim janitor and other janitors" 1871 AD is older than "Egyptian Girl".

In this painting, despite attempts to use perspective and view volume, the main theme and atmosphere of the painting is completely Iranian. A quick look at the same paintings in the "Egyptian Girl"’s period indicates similar performance in all works. All other works are painted in the same year (Fig. 4).

This painting, named "The Great Egyptian Woman", has been registered with file number "24429", on a label on the back of it, as the property of the National Parliament Library in Tehran. But today it is known as the "Egyptian Girl" in the Islamic Iranian Parliament Museum and the reason for this change is not known. The names of some of Kamal-al-Molk’s works have been chosen under the influence of his travels to Europe, and some others under the influence of his journey to Iraq, the places in which they were created. These works were mostly the copies of some artworks by famous artists or the portraits of the people to whom Kamal-al-Molk became acquainted in Iraq or the scenes he had viewed. Among these are: "Fantin-Latour (1896 AD)", the famous French painter to whom Kamal-al-Molk became familiar in his travel to Europe, "The Poultry Markets in Paris (1896 AD)", "Saint Matthew (1895 AD)" which is a copy of Rembrandt’s work, "Baqdadian Geomancer and His Student (1899 AD)" and "Karbala-ye-Moalla Square (1899 AD)". According to Kamal-al-Molk himself, he had never been to Egypt in his life time (Soheili Khansari, 1989). Golbon introduces two works named "Egyptian" and "Egyptian Man" among Kamal-al-Molk’s works. The "Egyptian Man" painting which was created in
1893 AD dates back to 19 years after the creation of the "Egyptian Girl".

As the Fig. 5 illustrates, this kind of painting is not similar to "Egyptian Girl" at all in terms of used colors and techniques. When we compare these two paintings, certain dissimilarities can be observed. The first point that attracts attention is the soft and natural painting fabric of "Egyptian man" versus the tough fabric in the "Egyptian Girl".

![Figure 5. Egyptian Man. 1893 AD. 27/5cm×54/5cm. The oil painting on the canvas. Location: Tehran, the Iranian Islamic Parliament Museum](www.kamalalmolk.info)

Moreover, Kamal-al-Molk’s power of drawing and having full control over anatomy and proportion is obvious. All these points can be observed in the "Egyptian Man" while "Egyptian Girl" lacks such characteristics. Furthermore, the color palette used in the "Egyptian man" is much more varied than the one used in the "Egyptian Girl". On the other hand, Golbon suggested, albeit with uncertainty, that "Egyptian man" is a copy of other’s painting work (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 332:1987). According to the date of the painting creation, 1893 AD, Kamal-al-Molk traveled to Europe one year later. In another work called "Egyptian", there is no available information and it is not clear if the subject of the painting is a man or woman, or even whether the "Egyptian" means "Egyptian girl" or not.

Regarding the name of this painting, it must have been of an Egyptian girl. Hence the study of Egyptian women’s clothing in the late 19th century by the authors clarify the relationship of the painting with its name. As expressed by Abbasi, it must be noted that since Egyptian women, like Iranian women, used to wear Chador[2] and Ruband[3] when they went out of the home (Racinet, 1995), women’s interior clothing in this period was studied (Abbasi, 2012).

As is shown, the form of sleeve and waist which is fastened with a very narrow and tight belt, and the inflated skirt of the model, her clothes are not similar to Egyptian women’s clothing in the 19th century. In Egyptian clothing, the waist of the clothing is usually ornamented with a scarf which is fastened around it, the skirts are not inflated and folded and the sleeves are generally long. Moreover, Egyptian dress has always been simple and straight, and were not at all likely to fold in this way. The clothes of the model do not seem to be similar to that of any region, even European clothing in the 19th century. According to these results it can be mentioned that this dress seems to be chosen imaginary. As mentioned previously, the clothing of the Egyptian girl in the painting is completely different from the clothing that Egyptian women used to wear in the 19th century. According to the appearance of the coating it can be said that it is likely that the subject is not an Egyptian girl. Based on recent discoveries, it can be concluded that the model of the examined painting does not share any of the Egyptian women’s clothing features, nor those of any Armenian and Georgian women, the countries that were in communication with Iran in that time. Therefore the notion that this work was created based on the ideal women of the Qajar period seems to be more logical, since this painting is very similar to the way Iranian women were painted in the 19th century (Abbasi, 86:2012). In Qajar portraits, the eyebrows are arched and eyes are sometimes languished. Although the faces are mostly in three quarter view the eyes are painted from the front angle, as if gazing at the viewers. The size of the nose in the portraits of this period is nearly in correct proportion with the other parts of the face, but is actually shown in profile. The mouth is very small and nearly in wide angle. The neck is in cylinder form and is put under the head like a column. In most of the portraits, the ears are hidden, or only a small part of one of them is shown. In most women’s portraits, more attention was paid to the earrings and hanging or-
namentations of the ears (Pakbaz, 2005). All these can be obviously seen in the "Egyptian Girl" painting.

According to the sources used in the process of this research, Kamal-al-Molk used several methods to paint the personages in his paintings. For some of his paintings he used photos (Soheili Khansari, 1989), and in others he copied the works of the great masters. Moreover, he sometimes used live models for his paintings (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 1987).

One of the techniques used regarding the subject of women in Kamal-al-Molk's painting was application of a picture (Karimzade Tabrizi, 1054:1991). He also copied some painting works (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 331:1987).

In the book of "Memory of Kamal-al-Molk", written by Hakim-al-Molk, there is a narration that he once used a young man as a model for painting a young woman (Foroughi et al., 85:1997). However, Karimzade Tabrizi in his book points out that Kamal-al-Molk used live women models in his paintings (Karimzade Tabrizi, 1057:1991).

Therefore, there exists the probability that he used all these methods for painting "the Egyptian Girl". According to the examinations done, and considering the fact that Kamal-al-Molk had never traveled to Egypt in his lifetime, and also the question raised over the relation between the model's clothing in this painting and Egyptian women's clothing in the 19th century, it can be concluded that perhaps Kamal-al-Molk did not use an Egyptian woman as the model of his painting. There is also some uncertainty about using a female model for his painting regarding the assertions of Hakim-al-Molk. There is further evidence for this fact according to Benjamin who says that well-behaved women of that time were not allowed to be a model of an artist, due to social circumstances of the time (Benjamin, 1887). So, there is more probability that Kamal-al-Molk used a photo, or copied this painting from the works of others. In Afshar-e-Mohajer's belief about European style, this method consists of paintings that were created by using European techniques, European or Iranian models, or applying Iranian techniques and styles, but with European models or themes (Afshar-e-Mohajer, 2005). It is clear that using European models was not a new found reality, and the title "Egyptian Girl" is attributed to this painting in recent years. So, it can also be considered that the model of Kamal-al-Molk was a European woman.

By reviewing the works created during Kamal-al-Molk's life, we found that he worked less on subjects like women than other subjects. According to Golbon, the list of paintings by Kamal-al-Molk with the subject of women include: "Woman near the lights", Painting of a woman who created a confederate with Gerdyjan, copy of Venus, " Egyptian woman", "Old Gospel writers of Saint Matthew", "Baqdad Druid", and another Egyptian woman painting. It is not clear what kind of paintings among his works are referred to as Egyptians (Foroughi et al, 14:1997), while the painting of women, owing to his acquaintance with the art of the West changed from the tastes of the court to public art, and from ideal, imaginary and limited subjects concerning the court affairs to realistic paintings related to everyday life. Initiation of this attitude can be seen clearly in the works of Kamal-al-Molk (Hatam & Hatampooh Ghiassi, 53:2010). Moreover, Karimzade Tabrizi claims that Kamal-al-Molk's paintings with the subject of women include: two beggar girls which he had copied from European models, partial penciled face of a girl painted based on the face of Narian Khan’s daughter's, portrait of a woman who is studying at the foot lights, Gospel writers of Saint Matthew, image of a standing naked women, Pardeh Ramal (a girl and old woman with one male Ramal[3]), Baqdad Druid, two images of a beautiful Iranian woman who lived in Vienna and whom Kamal-al-Molk had fallen in love, a portrait of a woman who is probably an immediate relative of the artist, sitting in a modest room feeding a little lamb next to her (Karimzade Tabrizi, 1051:1991). As mentioned before, no major study resource used the name of "Egyptian girl". None of the methods applied in the paintings of Two Beggar Girls, Old Gospel Writers of Saint Matthew, one woman who is studying at the foot lights, Pardeh Ramal, Baqdad Druid is similar to "Egyptian Girl" painting style. Other painting works are not available for the study. The first two paintings have European theme regarding visual space and subject
coverage. As noted earlier, “Two Beggar Girls” was copied from European models. There is an Iranian theme in both “Bagdad Druid” and “Pardeh Ramal” (geomancer) with stronger perspective work compared with the “Egyptian girl”.

Moreover, Kamal-al-Molk strongly believed that art is the absolute truth and he did not accept the unreal art far from truth (Naturalism) made by artist innovation and did not exist outside the real world. He suggested: “The truth is substantive in nature, but beauty is based on nature”. The forms can exist alone and the latter does not exist without the former (Shabahang and Dehbashi, 168:1987). Therefore, according to Realism, he trained his students not to focus on imaginative vision and guided them into the nature of reality. Kamal-al-Molk considered design as the basis of artworks and suggested that keeping the exact proportions is necessary. He always emphasized that an artist is not to be considered successful unless the drawing is sufficiently accurate (Pakbaz, 2005). This attitude is observable in his paintings (both in his works before and after his trip to Europe) (Figure 6). This approach made him a realistic painter, having said that, this preciseness is absent in "Egyptian Girl".

Figure 6. Kamal-al-Molk paintings. Photos: www.kamalalmolk.info

Hosseini quoted by Abbasi: “In paintings by Kamal-al-Molk (no copy) there is not even one case of subject forward rotation (the composition of figure). Both the men and women faces always seem imperative in the front angle (whether it is Nasser al-Din Shah, Baqdad Druid or old Jewish merchant). However, in this paint-
ing we observe a portrait different from what was said before. Also, what can be considered as a feature of Kamal-al-Molk’s works is his realistic portraits observable in all his works (Abbasi, 2012). However, the face drawn in the “Egyptian girl” lacked this characteristic. This type of look and facial expression cannot be considered as a Kamal-al-Molk work. Kamal-al-Molk’s style of painting mostly resembles that of the European realists. Therefore, in all of his works we see a kind of gesture and realistic figure, something that is not observed in this painting at all.

ART STUDY AND ANALYSIS

Having a knowledge of the facts about the time and place of created art works, is the most important factor in reaching an objective perception based on historical fact. These two points along with other artworks put art along a timeline and historiography. Irrefutable facts or facts agreed by most people, contain various information such as the current situation of art, its dimensions, the identity of the client, and the artist’s opinion about it and is the main application. So far, we investigated information found during our studies about the visual aspects of artworks. They contain information about the creator of the artwork and his living, social or work environment. However, to achieve a complete interpretation of one artwork it is necessary to collect visual data, especially information related to the art form and content of visual concepts in the artwork. Finally, after data collection, full interpretation of these concepts in “Egyptian girl” will be obtained.

The size of “Egyptian girl” was 98/5cm × 68/5cm calculated with the frame around 88/5cm × 119cm. The art technique is oil painting. Before studying the form, content and subject of the artwork, studying the application of “Egyptian Girl” as a complementary part of the general information about the artwork is necessary. Alan Gowans, the famous art historian, limited various applications of art into five major parts. According to Gowans opinion about multiple applications of artwork, reality records are the illustration and description of a part or the whole story to convince and teach beauty and offer a new definition of reality (Jansen, 15:1986).

Its function could be considered ornamentation, since as previously mentioned, the model of this painting could not have existed, and thus it could not have had the function of recording reality. On the other hand, there is no trace of any narrative or story in it. Also, it was not created to convince others or to communicate any specific idea or belief and, finally, it does not present a new definition of reality.

EVALUATION OF THE ARTWORK FORM

Form components in the artwork include visual elements and composition. Visual elements include line, color, degree of darkness and brightness or tonality, form, texture and space. Visual elements are the first parts sensed by the eyes.

According to Fig. 7, in "Egyptian Girl" all the visual elements are employed to suggest volume. The movements of the lines are very soft. There is no sharp contrast in the elements of the painting. Great attention is paid to details. As it can be seen in Fig. 7a, the artist, in order to make a balance between the dark and light values, has filled a triangle shaped part with the color used in the hands and the face regardless of its relation with the main theme of the painting. In Figure 7b, for evaluating the contrast between dark and light values, and also for evaluating the artist’s skill in using a variety of colors and the relationship between them, the painting is shown in black and white. In this figure color is eliminated from the painting, and it is shown only by using black grades, which can show that the artist has not used many color passages in this painting; further, there is no logical contrast for making the painting free from monotony and more eye catching, which suits the context better. The colored grays are used with nearly the same light tonal values. In Fig. 7c, for determining the firmness of the composition, particularly its colors, some of the light parts of the composition are filled with dark colors. The result of this is a symmetrical, balanced and logical contrast in the painting. Hence, it is concluded that the main composition of the painting is not correctly set and evaluated.
Figure 7. Egyptian girl, Kamal-al-Molk painting, 98/5cm × 68/5cm. The oil painting on the canvas the Iranian Islamic Parliament Museum, Tehran, figure a: www.kamalalmolk.info

On the other hand, as it can be seen in Figure 8a, by replacing the color of the light part on the curtain on the left-hand side of the painting, and a lack of balance and symmetry, it is concluded that the painter has intentionally and correctly chosen these colors.

In Figure 8b, different parts of the painting, except for the very dark colors and black, are eliminated. The aim of creating this figure is to show and clarify the distribution of these colors in the painting. Clever distribution of the dark values results in visual balance in the painting and the variety in the surface of these dark parts is of great importance and of the positive aspects in every work of art.

Figure 8. Egyptian girl, Kamal-al-Molk painting, 98/5cm × 68/5cm. The oil painting on the canvas, the Iranian Islamic Parliament Museum, Tehran, figure a: www.kamalalmolk.info

In this painting, the dark colors, in different surfaces, do not show a balanced rhythm and do not make a charming visual dialogue. In addition, examining the visual elements separately, all the visual elements are evaluated based on their function in the composition and also their kind of relationship with each other. It is the kind of relationship that forms our concept of the work, and finally determines the extent of effectiveness and powerfulness of the work of art. In Figure 8c, organic lines and the golden division are shown. The vertical orange line passes through the head and body of the model, and the horizontal lines pass through the shoulders and waist of the model. These lines and the mentioned relationship show the artist’s lack of mastery over the classic principles of European painting, since no special attention has been paid to the golden points in this frame. In Figure 8d, the relationship between the elements of the painting is shown by drawing the different rhythms of the work. This method allows the viewer to better observe the variety in the form of the painting. It attempts to examine the hidden relationships which can be felt through the forms of the painting. As can be seen in the figure, the form of the face and body of the model are placed in a triangle and the top of the triangle, for the aim of concentration, is the location of the head of the model.

According to Afshar-e-Mohajer, since the time of Reza Abbasi a mixed art named Farangi-Sazi (Europeanization) started to grow along with Isfahan school, among representations of which are the distorted understandings of perspective and European landscape painting, and is used for two different methods: paintings which were created by imitating the European techniques, using Iranian or European models, and paintings with Iranian methods and techniques but European models or scenes (Afshar-e-Mohajer, 2005).

Pakbaz also states that this Farangi-Sazi (Europeanization) tradition of the Safavid period found its way into the Zand and Qajar school of painting or courtly portrait, and was then delivered with some slight change to the Qajar period, introducing the characteristics of this method in this way: ‘symmetrical and arable composition with vertical, horizontal and curve ele-
ments, limited shadowing in face and clothing, combination of visual and ornamenting motifs, and limited coloring with the dominance of warm colors, especially red. In other words, this is a school in which naturalistic representation methods, abstraction, and ornamenting have come into terms in a very brilliant way.

In this school, the human body is of very great significance, nevertheless, in the used modeling technique, simulation is always being left behind for the sake of metaphorical beauty in appearance. It is often observed that the king, princes and bards of the court are shown standing alone by a window which its curtain is tied to one side” (Pakbaz, 2005). The style of the "Egyptian Girl" painting is very similar to the works of Qajar, Zand, and courtly portrait painting since (regarding Fig. 2) distorted imitations of European painting techniques such as perspective and modeling and landscape painting have been used. Human is chosen to be the main theme of the painting, and as mentioned previously, the human body has always been one of the important themes for Qajar and Zand artists. There is a limited shadowing in the faces, the clouds are painted like European ones, and the model is standing by a curtain.

The model in this painting has a rigid and stable position, and there is no fresh and vivid mood in her appearance. Her standing position in the painting is as if she is posing in front of a camera. But in the case of coloring, in contrast to Qajar and Zand schools, there is no usage of warm and vivid colors in this painting. The colors of this painting are almost gray colors. There is no significant characterization, but the artist’s attempt to do so is clearly seen. And according to James Wills’ lecturing on women’s portrait painting in the Qajar period: "Most Iranian women whose faces were painted on canvas or different books, have big and languished eyes, luscious lips like red carnelian, their eyebrows are very long, their cheeks are like apples and their hair a brownish color” (Wills, 1886). The same principled face can be seen here in this painting.

Indeed, the method used to create this painting shows the artist’s departure from Zand and Qajar schools and his greater tendency toward French realism style during the 1850 AD. Notwithstanding his effort for portrait painting and modeling method, simulation is extremely marginalized for the sake of metaphorical beauty and artificial glory. It can be said that an effort has been made to clearly demonstrate the wrinkles of clothing and the curtain. The wrinkles of the clothing are in complete accordance with the body frame. The colors are completely merged into each other. Brush strokes and even the texture of the canvas fabric are not visible.

The face is created in an extremely elaborated way, so the eyelashes and the hair of the eyebrows are clearly distinguished. The colors are completely diminished in the face and skin of the hands and its surface is finely polished, but the jewelry and the sign on the curtain and also the belt are embossed to some extent and the colors are very dense in these parts. The surface of the work is completely polished and shining. The green color is often used in combination with other colors in this work. In contrast to the other paintings in the Qajar period, green, blue and gray colors are dominant in this painting.

Evaluation of artwork is related to the importance of art. One part is a deliberate section and the other part is a reflection of the environment and its origin. The internal and external effects may have an influence on the form and the meaning of artwork.

Different Aspects of the Artwork Content:

1. Artist’s specific tendencies, values and beliefs: looking beyond form and themes used in the works of Kamal-al-Molk, we see a man who places a high value on accurate measurement, mathematical calculation and direct observation of nature. He was a man who considered the realistic view to be the highest level of art.

2. Special motives and purposes of the artist: Kamal-al-Molk’s limitless interest in art shows the ultimate goal of the human soul and the discovery of a fundamental unity in nature. He considered drawing as the basis of art. He always emphasized that if all aspects are to be considered by an artist carefully without consideration of a good and strong design, then the artist cannot be successful (Banan, 135:2000).

3. The artist’s interest, education and the effects of past and present: Mohammad Ghaffari
went to Tehran after a preliminary period of study in the city of Kashan in order to study (mostly painting) in Dar-al-Fonoon School. Mozayyan-al-Dowleh was the painting teacher of Dar-al-Fonoon in Nasser al-Din Shah’s court entitled “Naghashbashy”. He utilized his skills in realistic description in order to improve his works.

4. The social, political and economic structure: during the Qajar period, although Iran was ruled by great instability, a significant economic opportunity was established. The general historical movement of Iran in the fields of politics, economics, society and culture in the Qajar era was hastily run towards the west, especially during Kamal-al-Molk’s era, when his activity at the court was the most remarkable.

5. Needs and cultural interests that changed into goals and activities related to religious commitments and philosophical viewpoints: Iranian atmosphere during the Qajar period generally caused more interest for artists toward European naturalistic method. Interest and tendency towards European paintings to paint a real world, as it is not as it should be, was widespread (Abgineh Publications, 1986).

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF “EGYPTIAN GIRL” WITH OTHER WORKS ATTRIBUTED TO KAMAL-AL-MOLK

Another method of data collecting to have a better understanding of the art and its creator is the artists’ environment, a comparison of the artists’ artworks and related environments. Many factors may create a relation between two or more artists, artworks or artistic environments. For example, comparing artworks based on forms, similar paintings and related images in artworks or even common interest among artists and common religious beliefs within the context of art. However, the most important factors in the relationship between art, artists and communities in art history are time and place (Jansen, 1986). Comparative study is to realize a phenomenon or a belief in the light of comparison. Comparative studies are very important methods in the field of knowledge study in which investigation of different topics is possible. In other words, comparison can be used for all possible issues and topics. However, this type of study can be diverse in terms of different related levels. The first stage of comparative study is to demonstrate consistency and inconsistencies. Among objectives of the comparative study is to determine similar and comparable fields, recognition of wisdom and understanding of criteria for obtaining common and distinguishing features, and awareness about the lack of similarities (Zekrgo, 165:2003).

In this part, the painting “Egyptian Girl” is compared with “Egyptian Man” and “Egyptian Woman” by Kamal-al-Molk in terms of style and genre and also is studied and compared with a transverse comparative or cut off history study approach. Perhaps this kind of study is the most important, the most practical method of research in widely adaptive explored areas (Ibid). In this kind of study, a section of history and a limited topic in the art field is chosen, then the researcher makes transverse studies of the related object on two or more cultures, civilizations and regions. “Egyptian Woman” and “Egyptian Man” were investigated to study the change in outlook and style in the works of Kamal-al-Molk.

Figure (9): the Egyptian Woman, Kamal-al-Molk painting. 61 cm x 61 cm [M1]. The oil painting on the canvas, the Iranian Islamic Parliament Museum, Tehran, Figure a: www.kamalalmolk.info
In "Egyptian Woman", the subject is a woman with a soft body in the center of the painting frame with an object in her hand. As can be seen in Fig. 9a, despite the same subject of the painting in "Egyptian Girl" and "Egyptian Woman" which portrayed an Egyptian woman, there are many differences between the two paintings. In "Egyptian Woman", liveliness of the subject is much more than that of "Egyptian Girl". Their clothes are very different. According to the survey conducted in this paper on the clothes of Harem Egyptian Women in the nineteenth century, it seems that the woman's coverage in "Egyptian Woman" was not Egyptian. Contrary to what was observed in the "Egyptian Girl", the background is simple and the artist avoided using different elements to fill the gap in the space. Also, in "Egyptian woman" the subject's look is not towards the viewer. Here he plays a more active role of a painter and attracts the viewer's attention to the focal point of the painting, which is the object on the right hand of the subject.

In the "Egyptian Woman" we see a kind of dynamism in the subject, and the artist's use of the principles of European Paintings at the outstanding view of the artist as well as an understanding of the correct proportion of frames for more visual attraction compared to "Egyptian Girl". Finally, it can be concluded that Kamal-al-Molk's painting in "Egyptian Woman" is more mature and stronger in terms of drawing than "Egyptian Girl". Artist's color palette is limited in "Egyptian Woman". Warm colors domination could be clearly felt in the painting. We also pointed out earlier that in the Qajar period, the dominant colors in paintings were warm colors. It is obvious that Kamal-al-Molk does not follow this pattern in "Egyptian Girl". As can be seen in the next figure, the painting is changed into simple black and white surfaces to study the distribution of absolute dark and light colors. As shown in Fig. 9b, it can be seen that the artist in this work is trying to maintain a balance between the positive and negative space of the painting. Generally, this painting is formed by dark and bright areas of equality. Here you can see the logical relation between darkness and light. In "Egyptian woman", the artist is trying to make connection between the dark and light areas of the picture.

In Fig. 10a, the "Egyptian Woman" changed to black and white for investigating color passages. As it can be seen in the figure, the artist created the visual beauty applying a wide variety of bright and dark colors in different tonal values with a special elegance. There is an appropriate use of variety of tonalities in this painting and focal point for added attraction. In "Egyptian Girl", such a characteristic cannot be observed.

![Figure 10. composition analysis of the Egyptian Woman painting](image-url)
ledge about the relation between the divisions and visual elements within the frame related to composition. As mentioned earlier, Kamal-al-Molk did not have enough knowledge about this relationship and its impact on creation of "Egyptian Girl". As it can be seen, "Egyptian Woman" is stronger than "Egyptian Girl" by Kamal-al-Molk in terms of the divisions of the elements in the frame, and the type of selected frames.

As mentioned earlier, Golbon suggested two works of "Egyptian" and "Egyptian Man" among Kamal-al-Molk works. "Egyptian man" was painted in 1893 AD, almost 19 years after the "Egyptian Girl". As it is shown in Fig. 11a, the paintings in terms of colors and techniques are not similar to "Egyptian Girl". Comparing these two paintings, many differences can be observed. Moreover, Kamal-al-Molk’s power of good design and realism has full control over anatomy and fitness, which is obvious. All these points can be observed in the "Egyptian Man" while "Egyptian Girl" lacks such a characteristic. Furthermore, the color palette used in the "Egyptian man" is much more varied than the color palette used in the "Egyptian Girl". On the other hand, Golbon suggested with uncertainty that "Egyptian man" is a copy of others’ painting work (Shabahang and DehBashi, 332:1987). According to the date of the painting’s creation, 1893 AD; Kamal-al-Molk traveled to Europe one year later.

The selected colors of "Egyptian man" were chosen very pleasingly. Influence of the colors on each other, creation of the relationship between them and contrast colors were considered as the main principles of the new painting for painters of the nineteenth century. Many different combinations of colors can be seen in this painting compared to "Egyptian Girl". It can be concluded that "Egyptian Man" and "Egyptian Woman" were created during the same period. "Egyptian Girl" was not similar to these paintings in terms of color options and color method.

As it can be seen in Fig. 11b, the relationship between dark and light in this painting is very attractive and charming. Many color passages are used in this painting and a logical, interesting contrast can be observed. It seems that "Egyptian Man" is different from other studied paintings compared with "Egyptian Girl".

As can be seen in Fig. 11c, the painting is changed into simple black and white surfaces to study the distribution of absolute dark and light colors. Generally, this painting is formed by dark and light areas of equality. Here you can see the logical relation between darkness and lightness. In "Egyptian Man", the artist is trying to make connection between dark and bright areas of the picture. Ultimately, it can be said that the artist could create an overall collection of artworks and a good composition result despite the variation in levels of dark and light colors.

The "Egyptian Man" has a more diverse and stronger composition than "Egyptian Girl". Moreover, "Egyptian man" is more accurate than "Egyptian Girl" in terms of proportions and divisions in the frames of Kamal-al-Molk paintings. In addition, usage of various levels and
movement in the painting can be considered as another strong point compared to "Egyptian Girl" (see Fig. 12).

CONCLUSION

Based on the fact that there is a signature of "Khanzad Mohammad-e-Ghaffari, Naghashbashy -e-hozur-e-Homayouni" under the "Egyptian Girl", dated 1874 AD, it could be said that this is the oldest work of Kamal-al-Molk with the "Naghashbashy" signature on it. Also, by studying Kamal-al-Molk's autobiography, there is no reference to such a work named "Egyptian Girl" according to the subscribed date on the work, and the fact that he did not travel to Egypt during his life time. The clothing of the painted model is also very different from those worn by Egyptian women in the 19th century. The applied method of the artist in painting this model is not at all similar to the other women models in any of his works. Taking these facts into consideration, it is doubtful that this work can be attributed to Kamal-al-Molk. The influence of Eastern colors is seen in this work, although previously it was considered that the material used in this work was influenced by Western materials.

By investigation of Kamal-al-Molk and his studies we conclude that given the signature of "Khanzad Mohammad-e-Ghaffari, Naghashbashy-e-hozur-e-Homayouni", the painting was created during Kamal-al-Molk's (entitled Naghashbashy) era. As noted before, Naghashbashy title attributed to Kamal-al-Molk dates back to that period. Therefore, the oldest painting signed by Naghashbashy is seen via Kamal-al-Molk's "Egyptian Girl" in 1874 AD, unlike the opinion of many authors (Pakbaz and Golbon) who commented on "Government camp" landscape painting dating back to 1878 AD as the oldest work of Kamal-al-Molk signed by Naghashbashy. As noted above, "Egyptian Girl" is among the Kamal-al-Molk artworks before his trip to Europe. Therefore, it is natural that the result of the influence of European styles in the Kamal-al-Molk painting is continued. This painting compared to his subsequent works was at a lower and weaker level in terms of color compositions and choices. During this study, in addition to diaries, letters, descriptions of Kamal-al-Molk's life history by his friends and himself, Kamal-al-Molk's "Egyptian girl" is not mentioned regarding the date inserted on the painting.

Major of Kamal-al-Molk's works (more landscape painting and less human painting) during the period in which he is called "Naghashbashy" are considered as the main subject matter of the painting. Generally, more landscape and less active personage could be observed in the painting works and if there was any human feature in the painting, they were actually painted in a very small scale in the context of natural landscapes. By reviewing Kamal-al-Molk's paintings investigation in the period before being entitled Naghashbashy, including "Egyptian girl", we come to understand that most paintings are similar in terms of technique; and of course the works of this period by Kamal-al-Molk are weaker than the period after being given the title: Naghashbashy.

Referring to Kamal-al-Molk's autobiography, we realized that he had no trip to Egypt during his lifetime. "Egyptian man" was painted in 1893 AD almost 19 years after the "Egyptian Girl". The paintings in terms of colors and techniques are not similar to "Egyptian Girl". When these two paintings are compared, many differences can be observed. On the other hand, Golbon suggested with uncertainty that "Egyptian man" is a copy of others' painting work. According to the date of the creation of the painting, 1893 AD, Kamal-al-Molk traveled to Europe one year later.

As mentioned before, in "Egyptian Girl" the Girl's clothing is different from the common Egyptian clothes in the nineteenth century.
Therefore, it can be concluded that the clothes of the subject of the painting not only are not similar to Egyptian style but also differ from the women’s clothing style of Armenia and Georgia that had connections with Iran at the time. So perhaps this assumption may seem more logical if we consider the painting as the ideal image of women in the Qajar era. As can be seen here, a number of similarities exist in the Egyptian girl paintings in the nineteenth century. Although it can be said that Egyptian Girl’s clothing is completely similar to the Qajar images of women, as many similar characteristics can be observed, Egyptian Girl dress is painted in a completely subjective manner. In fact, it includes Qajar women’s ideal characteristics. Furthermore, according to the research resources during this study, Kamal-al-Molk’s painting of personages was based on several methods. Therefore, it is also possible to consider that a European woman model was copied by Kamal-al-Molk. Reviewing his works, we find that subject matters like woman are comparatively less common. None of the methods used in Kamal-al-Molk’s paintings are similar to the woman personage in "Egyptian girl". Finally, it was concluded that the style of "Egyptian girl" is very similar to Qajar school works and the court painters, as European art manners including perspective and outstanding scenic view in the painting are not applied thoroughly. Therefore, the method used in this study indicates the remoteness of the painting from the Zand and Qajar painting style with greater tendency towards European realist style. Analysis of the painting also points out that the painter did not use many color passages, and there is no evidence of rational contrast in the painting to increase the attractiveness. Actually, gray colors with a similar tonal value of darkness and lightness are used in the painting. The main composition of the painting is not appropriate and accurate. This painting, with colors of the same tonal values of darkness implemented in various levels does not represent a balanced rhythm.

Finally, selected colors of "Egyptian man" are chosen to be pleasing to the eye. The impact of the colors on each other, the connection between them and the contrast colors were considered as the main principles of the new painting for painters of the nineteenth century. Many different combinations of colors can be seen in this painting compared to "Egyptian Girl". It can be concluded that "Egyptian man" and "Egyptian Woman" were created during the same period. "Egyptian girl" was not similar to these paintings in terms of color options and color method. Therefore, "Egyptian woman" and "Egyptian man" were created in the same period while "Egyptian girl" is not similar to any of the Kamal-al-Molk’s works in terms of color and color options.

Finally, it can be said that the oldest painting signed by Naghashbashy is available by Kamal-al-Molk "Egyptian girl" in 1874 AD, unlike the opinion of many authors (Pakbaz and Golbon) who commented on the "Government camp" landscape painting dating back to 1878 AD as the oldest work of Kamal-al-Molk, signed by Naghashbashy. As noted above, "Egyptian Girl" is among Kamal-al-Molk’s artworks before his trip to Europe. Therefore, it is natural that the result of the influence of European styles in the Kamal-al-Molk’s painting is continued. Egyptian woman" and "Egyptian man" were created in the same period while "Egyptian girl" is not similar to any of the Kamal-al-Molk’s works in terms of clothing style. Finally, we concluded that the style of "Egyptian girl" is similar to Qajar school works and the court painters.

The results gained from experiments conducted over the "Egyptian Girl" showed three pigments of white lead, white tin and chalk powder. (refer to the second paper). However, according to the results of identifying white samples extracted from the damaged parts of the work, and also by conducting some experiments on the white samples and finding a great deal of chalk powder along with white lead in this sample as a result, it is concluded that the artist had used white lead as the white color in "Egyptian Girl", and white lead had been widely used in its restoration. The Iranian artist had used white lead, as common pigment in Iranian painting. So it could be said that the white pigment used in this painting had been influenced by previous Iranian artistic periods to Qajar.

Distinguished black and yellow pigments in "Egyptian Girl" is amber color, a composition of iron oxide, manganese oxide and clay. It must
be mentioned that it is considered as an earthen pigment and was not a new pigment during the Qajar period, as it had also been used in painting during the Safavid period previous to Qajar. During this research, the blue pigment used in the "Egyptian Girl" painting was found to be cerulean blue. The artist's use of this pigment reflects his knowledge of new synthetic materials.

The red pigment used in this work was found to be red copper; red copper pigment was also used in Iranian manuscripts. The artist’s use of red copper pigment was due to his influence from previous Iranian artistic periods to that time.

The golden pigments used in the "Egyptian Girl" were found to be alloys of copper. The use of this kind of pigment in this painting could be considered as a wide range of its use during the Safavid period in Iran.

The paste sample applied on the back of the work: plant glue, the material used for ground layer: chalk powder, the applied varnishes in the painting: shellac varnishes, and the oil used in this work: linseed oil.

The fibers used to make the canvas were distinguished as cotton, and the ones used in its restoration as wool.

Given these results, it is doubtful that this artwork belongs to Kamal-al-Molk.

NOTES:
[1] large veil worn by a woman to cover her body and dress
[2] Cloth mask
[3] Ramal in farsi means geomancer
[4] This painting now belongs to The Malek National Library and Museum Institution and along some other paintings were bought from Heidar Gholi Khan – the forth son of Kamal-al-Molk in 1942 AD.

REFERENCES


Wills, C.J. (1886), Persia as it is: being sketches of modern Persian life and character, Sampson Low, Marston, London.


Zoka, Y. (1976), Look at the Negargari in Iran in 18th and 19th countries, Special office of Farah Pahlavi, Tehran. (In Farsi)